

# 1 Problem 1

- a) Find the open string amplitude for one tachyon and two massless vectors. Show that it is non-vanishing even without Chan-Paton degrees of freedom, and also give the form with Chan-Paton wavefunctions included.
- b) Find a gauge invariant Lagrangian that produces such an amplitude.
- 

## 1.1 Part (a)

The open string tachyon and massless vector states are given by

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_0^\mu |0; k\rangle &\text{ with } m_0^2 = -\alpha' \\ e_\mu \alpha_1^\mu |0; k\rangle &\text{ with } m_1^2 = 0 \end{aligned}$$

where the polarizations of the massless vector states satisfy  $e \cdot k = 0$ . The vertex operators for the tachyon and two massless vectors are, respectively,

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{V}_1 &= g_o : e^{ik_1 \cdot X(y_1, y_1)} : \\ \mathcal{V}_2 &= -\frac{ig_o}{\sqrt{2\alpha'}} e_{2\mu} : \dot{X}^\mu e^{ik_2 \cdot X(y_2, y_2)} : \\ \mathcal{V}_3 &= -\frac{ig_o}{\sqrt{2\alpha'}} e_{3\mu} : \dot{X}^\mu e^{ik_3 \cdot X(y_3, y_3)} : \end{aligned}$$

where  $y_i$  are the insertion points of the operators on the boundary.

For three particle scattering the  $S$ -matrix is

$$\begin{aligned} S(k_1, k_2, k_3) &= \sum_{\substack{\text{compact} \\ \text{topologies}}} \int \frac{[dX dg]}{V_{\text{diff} \times \text{Weyl}}} \exp(-S_X - \lambda\chi) \prod_{i=1}^3 \int d^2\sigma_i \sqrt{g(\sigma_i)} \mathcal{V}_i(k_i, \sigma_i) \\ &\xrightarrow[\text{at tree level}]{} -\frac{g_o^3}{2\alpha'} e^{-\lambda} \text{Jacobian}(g) \left\langle {}^*_\star e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} {}^{**}_{\star\star} e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2 e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} {}^{**}_{\star\star} e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} {}^*_\star \right\rangle \\ &\quad + (y_2 \leftrightarrow y_3) \end{aligned}$$

where  $X_i = X(y_i, y_i)$ . Only the fully contracted terms in of the OPE for  ${}^*_\star e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} {}^{**}_{\star\star} e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2 e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} {}^{**}_{\star\star} e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} {}^*_\star$  survive the expectation value. Therefore, the relevant terms in the OPE are

$$\begin{aligned} {}^*_\star e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} {}^{**}_{\star\star} e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2 e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} {}^{**}_{\star\star} e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} {}^*_\star &\sim 2\alpha' \left[ 2\alpha' \left( \frac{(k_3 \cdot e_2)(k_1 \cdot e_3)}{y_{23}y_{13}} + \frac{(k_3 \cdot e_2)(k_2 \cdot e_3)}{y_{23}^2} - \frac{(k_1 \cdot e_2)(k_1 \cdot e_3)}{y_{12}y_{13}} \right. \right. \\ &\quad \left. \left. - \frac{(k_1 \cdot e_2)(k_2 \cdot e_3)}{y_{12}y_{23}} \right) - \frac{(e_2 \cdot e_3)}{y_{23}^2} \right] + y_{12}^{2\alpha' k_1 \cdot k_2} y_{13}^{2\alpha' k_1 \cdot k_2} y_{23}^{2\alpha' k_2 \cdot k_3} \end{aligned}$$

(see Appendix for the details). Simplify using momentum conservation  $k_1 + k_2 + k_3 = 0$  and  $e_i \cdot k_i = 0$ , we obtain

$${}^*_\star e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} {}^{**}_{\star\star} e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2 e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} {}^{**}_{\star\star} e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} {}^*_\star \sim \frac{2\alpha'}{y_{23}^2} [2\alpha' (k_3 \cdot e_2)(k_2 \cdot e_3) - (e_2 \cdot e_3)] \frac{|y_{23}|}{|y_{12}| |y_{13}|}.$$

The other cyclic ordering yield the same result. Therefore, the scattering amplitude is

$$2(2\pi)^D \delta^D \left( \sum k \right) (ig_o [(e_2 \cdot e_3) - 2\alpha' (k_3 \cdot e_2)(k_2 \cdot e_3)])$$

where we have used

$$e^{-\lambda} = \frac{i}{\alpha' g_o^2}$$

$$\text{Jacobian}(g) = |y_{12}y_{13}y_{23}|.$$

To include the Chan-Paton factor we multiply by  $\frac{1}{2}\text{Tr}[\lambda_a \{\lambda_b, \lambda_c\}]$

$$(2\pi)^D \delta^D \left( \sum k \right) (ig_o [(e_2 \cdot e_3) - 2\alpha' (k_3 \cdot e_2) (k_2 \cdot e_3)]) \text{Tr}[\lambda_a \{\lambda_b, \lambda_c\}].$$

## 1.2 Part (b)

The trace part looks like the trace over non-Abelian group generators. Since the tachyon is a scalar, we guess that the Lagrangian should be a scalar field coupled to a non-abelian gauge field

$$\begin{aligned} L &= -\frac{1}{4}F^2 - \frac{1}{2} \left( (D_\mu \phi)^2 - \frac{1}{\alpha'} \phi^2 \right) + \text{Tr} \left[ -\frac{1}{4}F^2 - \frac{1}{2} \left( (D_\mu \phi^a)^2 - \frac{1}{\alpha'} \phi^2 \right) + g_o F_{\mu\nu}^a F^{b\mu\nu} \phi^c \lambda^a \lambda^b \lambda^c \right] \\ &= -\frac{1}{4}F^2 - \frac{1}{2} \left( (D_\mu \phi)^2 - \frac{1}{\alpha'} \phi^2 \right) + g_o F_{\mu\nu}^a F^{b\mu\nu} \phi^c \text{Tr}[\lambda^a \lambda^b \lambda^c] \end{aligned}$$

where  $\phi$  has a gauge index. Here

$$\begin{aligned} -\frac{1}{4}F^2 &\quad \text{gauge boson kinetic term,} \\ -\frac{1}{2}(D_\mu \phi)^2 &\quad \text{tachyon kinetic and 4pt. interaction,} \\ \frac{1}{2\alpha'} \phi^2 &\quad \text{tachyon mass term } \left( m_{\text{tachyon}} = -\frac{1}{\alpha'} \right), \\ g_o F^2 &\quad \text{3pt. interaction term needed to get } A - A - \phi \text{ scattering.} \end{aligned}$$

We need to calculate the 3pt interaction term to get the  $A - A - \phi$  vertex

$$\begin{aligned} g_o \phi^a F_{\mu\nu}^b F^{c\mu\nu} \text{Tr}[\lambda^a \lambda^b \lambda^c] &= \frac{g_o}{2} \phi^a F_{\mu\nu}^b F^{c\mu\nu} \text{Tr}[\lambda^a \{\lambda^b, \lambda^c\}] \\ &= \frac{g_o}{2} \phi^a (\partial_\mu A_\nu^b - \partial_\nu A_\mu^b + g_o f^{bde} A_\mu^d A_\nu^e) (\partial^\mu A^{c\nu} - \partial^\nu A^{c\mu} + g_o f^{cfg} A^{f\mu} A^{g\nu}) \text{Tr}[\lambda^a \{\lambda^b, \lambda^c\}] \\ &= g_o \phi^a \left[ \partial_\mu A_\nu^b \partial^\mu A^{c\nu} - \partial_\mu A_\nu^b \partial^\nu A^{c\mu} + \frac{g_o}{2} (f^{cde} \partial_\mu A_\nu^b + f^{bde} \partial_\mu A_\nu^c) A^{d\mu} A^{e\nu} \right. \\ &\quad \left. - \frac{g_o}{2} (f^{cde} \partial_\nu A_\mu^b - f^{bde} \partial_\nu A_\mu^c) A^{d\mu} A^{e\nu} + \frac{g_o^2}{2} f^{bde} f^{cfg} A_\mu^d A_\nu^e A^{f\mu} A^{g\nu} \right] \text{Tr}[\lambda^a \{\lambda^b, \lambda^c\}]. \end{aligned}$$

From the above equation we can read off the  $A - A - \phi$  vertex

$$-2ig_o ((k_2 \cdot k_3) (e_2 \cdot e_3) + (k_2 \cdot e_3) (e_2 \cdot k_3)) \text{Tr}[\lambda^a \{\lambda^b, \lambda^c\}]$$

where all momentum are incoming and the factor of 2 comes from permuting the legs of the diagram. For on-shell scattering,

$$\begin{aligned} k_1 &= -k_2 - k_3 \\ -k_1^2 &= -2k_2 \cdot k_3 = -\frac{1}{\alpha'} \end{aligned}$$

and the amplitude becomes

$$\frac{ig_o}{\alpha'} ((e_2 \cdot e_3) - 2(k_2 \cdot e_3)(e_2 \cdot k_3)) \text{Tr}[\lambda^a \{\lambda^b, \lambda^c\}]$$

which matches the earlier result.

### 1.3 Appendix for 1(a)

- We need to calculate the full OPE for  $\star e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} \star e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2 e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} \star$ . In general, the normal ordered product of two operators is

$$:\mathcal{F}::\mathcal{G}:=\exp\left(\int d^2z d^2\omega G(z, \bar{z}; \omega, \bar{\omega}) \frac{\delta}{\delta X_{\mathcal{F}}^\mu(z, \bar{z})} \frac{\delta}{\delta X_{\mathcal{G}\mu}(\omega, \bar{\omega})}\right) : \mathcal{F}\mathcal{G} :$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} G_{\text{open}}(z, \bar{z}; \omega, \bar{\omega}) &= -\frac{\alpha'}{2} \ln |z - \omega|^2 - \frac{\alpha'}{2} \ln |z - \bar{\omega}|^2, \\ G_{\text{closed}}(z, \bar{z}; \omega, \bar{\omega}) &= -\frac{\alpha'}{2} \ln |z - \omega|^2. \end{aligned}$$

Thus,

$$\begin{aligned} &: e^{ik_z \cdot X(z, \bar{z})} :: \partial_\omega X^\mu(\omega, \bar{\omega}) e^{ik_\omega \cdot X(\omega, \bar{\omega})} : \\ &=: \exp\left(\int d^2z_1 d^2\omega_1 G(z_1, \bar{z}_1; \omega_1, \bar{\omega}_1) \frac{\delta}{\delta X_{\mathcal{F}}^\mu(z_1, \bar{z}_1)} \frac{\delta}{\delta X_{\mathcal{G}\mu}(\omega_1, \bar{\omega}_1)}\right) e^{ik_z \cdot X_{\mathcal{F}}(z, \bar{z})} \partial_\omega X_{\mathcal{G}}^\mu(\omega, \bar{\omega}) e^{ik_\omega \cdot X_{\mathcal{G}}(\omega, \bar{\omega})} : \\ &=: \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n!} \int d^2z_1 \dots d^2z_n d^2\omega_1 \dots d^2\omega_n G(z_1, \bar{z}_1; \omega_1, \bar{\omega}_1) \dots G(z_n, \bar{z}_n; \omega_n, \bar{\omega}_n) \\ &\quad \times \left[ \left( \prod_{i=1}^n \frac{\delta}{\delta X_{\mathcal{F}\mu_i}(z_i, \bar{z}_i)} \right) e^{ik_\omega \cdot X_{\mathcal{F}}(z, \bar{z})} \right] \left[ \left( \prod_{i=1}^n \frac{\delta}{\delta X_{\mathcal{G}\mu_i}(\omega_i, \bar{\omega}_i)} \right) \partial_\omega X_{\mathcal{G}}^\mu(\omega, \bar{\omega}) e^{ik_\omega \cdot X_{\mathcal{G}}(\omega, \bar{\omega})} \right] : \\ &= ik_z^\mu \left( \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{n}{n!} G^{n-1}(z, \bar{z}; \omega, \bar{\omega}) (-k_z \cdot k_\omega)^{n-1} \right) \partial_\omega G(z, \bar{z}; \omega, \bar{\omega}) : e^{ik_z \cdot X(z, \bar{z})} e^{ik_\omega \cdot X(\omega, \bar{\omega})} : \\ &\quad + \left( \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{(-k_z \cdot k_\omega)^n G^n(z, \bar{z}; \omega, \bar{\omega})}{n!} \right) : \partial_\omega X_{\mathcal{G}}^\mu(\omega, \bar{\omega}) e^{ik_z \cdot X(z, \bar{z})} e^{ik_\omega \cdot X(\omega, \bar{\omega})} : \\ &= ik_z^\mu \exp(-k_z \cdot k_\omega G(z, \bar{z}; \omega, \bar{\omega})) \partial_\omega G(z, \bar{z}; \omega, \bar{\omega}) : e^{ik_z \cdot X(z, \bar{z})} e^{ik_\omega \cdot X(\omega, \bar{\omega})} : \\ &\quad + \exp(-k_z \cdot k_\omega G(z, \bar{z}; \omega, \bar{\omega})) : \partial_\omega X_{\mathcal{G}}^\mu(\omega, \bar{\omega}) e^{ik_z \cdot X(z, \bar{z})} e^{ik_\omega \cdot X(\omega, \bar{\omega})} : \end{aligned}$$

where we have used the result

$$\begin{aligned} &\left( \prod_{i=1}^n \frac{\delta}{\delta X_{\mathcal{G}\mu_i}(\omega_i, \bar{\omega}_i)} \right) \partial_\omega X_{\mathcal{G}}^\mu(\omega, \bar{\omega}) e^{ik_\omega \cdot X_{\mathcal{G}}(\omega, \bar{\omega})} \\ &= \left( \prod_{i=1}^n ik_{\omega\mu_i} \delta(\omega_i - \omega, \bar{\omega}_i - \bar{\omega}) \right) \partial_\omega X_{\mathcal{G}}^\mu(\omega, \bar{\omega}) e^{ik_\omega \cdot X_{\mathcal{G}}(\omega, \bar{\omega})} \\ &\quad + \sum_{i=1}^n \eta_{\mu_j}^\mu \partial_\omega \delta(\omega_i - \omega, \bar{\omega}_i - \bar{\omega}) \left( \prod_{j \neq 1}^n ik_{\omega\mu_i} \delta(\omega_j - \omega, \bar{\omega}_j - \bar{\omega}) \right) e^{ik_\omega \cdot X_{\mathcal{G}}(\omega, \bar{\omega})}. \end{aligned}$$

- Specifically, we obtain

$$\star e^{ik_1 \cdot X(y_1, y_1)} \star \partial_{y_2} X^\mu(y_2, y_2) e^{ik_2 \cdot X(y_2, y_2)} \star = 2i\alpha' \frac{(k_1 \cdot e_2)}{y_{12}} y_{12}^{2\alpha' k_1 \cdot k_2} \star e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} \star + y_{12}^{2\alpha' k_1 \cdot k_2} \star e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2 e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} \star$$

- The OPE for the full operator is

$$\begin{aligned} \star e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} \star e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2 e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} \star e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} \star &= 2i\alpha' \frac{(k_1 \cdot e_2)}{y_{12}} y_{12}^{2\alpha' k_1 \cdot k_2} \star e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} \star e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} \star \\ &\quad + y_{12}^{2\alpha' k_1 \cdot k_2} \star e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2 e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} \star e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} \star. \end{aligned}$$

- We need to OPE's for

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{O}_1 &= {}^*_{\star} e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} {}^{**}_{\star\star} e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} {}^{\star}_{\star} \\ \mathcal{O}_2 &= {}^*_{\star} e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2 e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} {}^{**}_{\star\star} e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} {}^{\star}_{\star}.\end{aligned}$$

At this point we can drop all terms that are not fully contracted. This will make the calculation of the above OPE's much easier.

- The OPE for  $\mathcal{O}_1$ :

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{O}_1 &= {}^*_{\star} e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} {}^{\star}_{\star} + {}^*_{\star} \sum_{CC} \left[ e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2}, e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} \right] {}^*_{CC} \\ &\sim {}^*_{\star} \sum_{m,n,l=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{m!n!l!} \sum_{CC} \left[ (ik_1 \cdot X_1)^m (ik_2 \cdot X_2)^n, (e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3) (ik_3 \cdot X_3)^l \right] {}^*_{CC}\end{aligned}$$

where  $\sum_{CC} [A, B]_{CC}$  is the sum over all cross-contractions of  $A$  and  $B$  and  $\sim$  means equivalent up to terms that are normal ordered. Keeping only fully contracted terms we obtain

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{O}_1 &\sim \left[ (ik_1 \cdot X_1), (e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3) \right] {}^*_{CC} \sum_{m=1}^{\infty} \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{(m-1)!n!} [(ik_1 \cdot X_1), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)] {}^{m-1}_{CC} [(ik_2 \cdot X_2), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)] {}^n_{CC} \\ &\quad + \left[ (ik_2 \cdot X_2), (e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3) \right] {}^*_{CC} \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{(n-1)!m!} [(ik_1 \cdot X_1), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)] {}^m_{CC} [(ik_2 \cdot X_2), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)] {}^{n-1}_{CC} \\ &= \left( \left[ (ik_1 \cdot X_1), (e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3) \right] {}^*_{CC} + \left[ (ik_2 \cdot X_2), (e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3) \right] {}^*_{CC} \right) e^{[(ik_1 \cdot X_1), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)]_{CC}} e^{[(ik_2 \cdot X_2), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)]_{CC}} \\ &= \left( -2i\alpha' (k_1 \cdot e_3) \frac{\partial \ln(y_1 - y_3)}{\partial y_3} - 2i\alpha' (k_2 \cdot e_3) \frac{\partial \ln(y_2 - y_3)}{\partial y_3} \right) e^{2\alpha' k_1 \cdot k_3 \ln(y_1 - y_3)} e^{2\alpha' k_2 \cdot k_3 \ln(y_2 - y_3)} \\ &= \left( 2i\alpha' \frac{(k_1 \cdot e_3)}{y_{13}} + 2i\alpha' \frac{(k_2 \cdot e_3)}{y_{23}} \right) y_{13}^{2\alpha' k_1 \cdot k_3} y_{23}^{2\alpha' k_2 \cdot k_3}.\end{aligned}$$

– The OPE for  $\mathcal{O}_2$ :

$$\begin{aligned}
\mathcal{O}_2 &= {}^*_{\star} e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2 e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} {}^{\star}_{\star} + {}^*_{\star} \sum_{CC} \left[ e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2 e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2}, e \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} \right]_{CC} {}^{\star}_{\star} \\
&\sim {}^*_{\star} \sum_{m,n,l=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{m!n!l!} \sum_{CC} \left[ (e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2) (ik_1 \cdot X_1)^m (ik_2 \cdot X_2)^n, (e \cdot \dot{X}_3) (ik_3 \cdot X_3)^l \right]_{CC} {}^{\star}_{\star} \\
&\sim \left[ (e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2), (e \cdot \dot{X}_3) \right]_{CC} \sum_{m,n=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{m!n!} [(ik_1 \cdot X_1), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)]_{CC}^m [(ik_2 \cdot X_2), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)]_{CC}^n \\
&\quad + \sum_{m=1,n=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{(m-1)!n!} [(ik_1 \cdot X_1), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)]_{CC}^{m-1} [(ik_2 \cdot X_2), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)]_{CC}^n \\
&\quad \times \left[ (e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2), (ik_3 \cdot X_3) \right]_{CC} \left[ (e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3), (ik_1 \cdot X_1) \right]_{CC} \\
&\quad + \sum_{m=0,n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{m!(n-1)!} [(ik_1 \cdot X_1), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)]_{CC}^m [(ik_2 \cdot X_2), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)]_{CC}^{n-1} \\
&\quad \times \left[ (e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2), (ik_3 \cdot X_3) \right]_{CC} \left[ (e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3), (ik_2 \cdot X_2) \right]_{CC} \\
&= \left( \left[ (e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2), (e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3) \right]_{CC} + \left[ (e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2), (ik_3 \cdot X_3) \right]_{CC} \left[ (e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3), (ik_1 \cdot X_1) \right]_{CC} \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \left[ (e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2), (ik_3 \cdot X_3) \right]_{CC} \left[ (e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3), (ik_2 \cdot X_2) \right]_{CC} \right) e^{[(ik_1 \cdot X_1), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)]_{CC}} e^{[(ik_2 \cdot X_2), (ik_3 \cdot X_3)]_{CC}} \\
&= \left( -2\alpha' \frac{(e_2 \cdot e_3)}{y_{23}^2} + (2\alpha')^2 \frac{(k_3 \cdot e_2)(k_1 \cdot e_3)}{y_{23}y_{13}} + (2\alpha')^2 \frac{(k_3 \cdot e_2)(k_2 \cdot e_3)}{y_{23}^2} \right) y_{13}^{2\alpha' k_1 \cdot k_2} y_{23}^{2\alpha' k_2 \cdot k_3}
\end{aligned}$$

• Now we can write the full OPE

$${}^*_{\star} e^{ik_1 \cdot X_1} {}^{\star\star}_{\star\star} e_2 \cdot \dot{X}_2 e^{ik_2 \cdot X_2} {}^{\star\star}_{\star\star} e_3 \cdot \dot{X}_3 e^{ik_3 \cdot X_3} {}^{\star}_{\star} \sim 2\alpha' \left[ 2\alpha' \left( \frac{(k_3 \cdot e_2)(k_1 \cdot e_3)}{y_{23}y_{13}} + \frac{(k_3 \cdot e_2)(k_2 \cdot e_3)}{y_{23}^2} - \frac{(k_1 \cdot e_2)(k_1 \cdot e_3)}{y_{12}y_{13}} \right. \right. \\
\left. \left. - \frac{(k_1 \cdot e_2)(k_2 \cdot e_3)}{y_{12}y_{23}} \right) - \frac{(e_2 \cdot e_3)}{y_{23}^2} \right] + y_{12}^{2\alpha' k_1 \cdot k_2} y_{13}^{2\alpha' k_1 \cdot k_2} y_{23}^{2\alpha' k_2 \cdot k_3}$$